September 12, 2017

The Honorable Paul Ryan  
The Speaker of the House of Representatives  
United States Capitol  
Washington, D.C.  20515

**RE: Criminal Alien Gang Member Removal Act, H.R. 3697**

Dear Mr. Speaker:

The undersigned\(^1\) are a group of immigration law professors and scholars with expertise in immigration and constitutional law, and it is our opinion that *Criminal Alien Gang Member Removal Act*, H.R. 3697 is overbroad and unconstitutional. H.R. 3697 would be an unnecessary expansion of existing immigration laws that already punish gang involvement, it would infringe upon constitutional due process protections, and it does not include any exceptions for cooperation with a gang under duress—a common scenario for youths and families who have fled to the United States seeking international protection.

First, the bill creates an exceedingly broad definition of the term “gang” as an ongoing group, club, organization, or association of five or more persons that has as one of its primary purposes the commission of certain offenses that could include felony drug possession, or harboring immigrants. The language of this bill is so broad that the Secretary of the Department of Homeland Security (DHS) could attempt to extend the definition beyond its stated purpose. For example, DHS could impermissibly try to classify a church group that gives sanctuary to an immigrant child, or a group of high school students who smoke marijuana together, as members of a gang.

Second, the bill grants the DHS nearly unfettered authority to designate nearly all types of clubs and groups as a “criminal gang” and provides an unconstitutionally low standard for determining who is a gang member. It would allow DHS to use secret information to designate any group of five people or more a “gang” without any prior notice to the group. Then, if the government knows or has “reason to believe” the person (1) is in such a gang, (2) has ever been in such a gang, or (3) has participated in the activities of such a gang knowing or having reason to know that such activities will promote, further, aid or support the gang’s illegal activities—those individuals can be removable, barred from certain forms of relief, and subjected to mandatory detention. Thus, immigrants could be denied admission, denied a bond hearing, or even deported with little due process based on scant evidence of an alleged gang affiliation.

---

\(^1\) Institutional affiliations are for identification purposes only.
This standard flies in the face of constitutional due process protections. Neither the process for designation nor the process for associating someone with a group meets a basic constitutional floor. The low standard of proof combined with the extremely diffuse nature of the conduct that can bring a person within the scope of the bar would ensnare individuals that the humanitarian protections built into U.S. law are designed to protect. These fears are not merely speculative, as advocates and juvenile probation offices have already noted that Immigration and Customs Enforcement (ICE) misidentifies unaccompanied children as gang members based on little or no evidence. This misclassification permits ICE to take into custody unaccompanied children, often sending them thousands of miles from their homes, families, and schools. Moreover, this standard does not permit youths who were once affiliated with gangs, but have since rehabilitated, a second chance.

Third, the bill also fails to create a duress exception for individuals who were forced to affiliate with gangs to survive. H.R. 3697 could bar from asylum and Special Immigrant Juvenile Visa Status many vulnerable individuals, like women and children—the very immigrants Congress has sought to protect. Without a duress exception, H.R. 3697 could ensnare asylum seekers that were forced against their will to provide even minimal assistance to gangs.

The proposed amendment to the INA is unnecessary because the immigration laws already provide significant and comprehensive criminal grounds of removal and bars to immigration protection. The INA’s grounds of inadmissibility and deportability, as well as the INA’s bars to humanitarian protection, are so broad as to capture nearly all the criminal conduct addressed by HR 3697, and this bill will ensnare people that Congress has indicated its intent to protect.

Sincerely,

Holly S. Cooper
Co-Director Immigration Law Clinic
UC Davis School of Law

Annie Lai*
Assistant Clinical Professor of Law
UC Irvine School of Law

Deborah Anker*
Clinical Professor of Law
Harvard Law School

Maureen Sweeney*
Associate Professor
University of Maryland Francis King Carey School of Law

Sabi Ardalan*
Assistant Clinical Professor
Harvard Law School

Philip L. Torrey*
Managing Attorney
Harvard Immigration and Refugee Clinical Program
Harvard Law School


∗ Institutional affiliations are for identification purposes only.
Christopher N. Lasch*
Associate Professor
University of Denver Sturm College of Law

Barbara Hines*
Clinical Professor of Law (retired)
University of Texas School of Law

Dan R. Smulian*
Associate Professor of Clinical Law
Brooklyn Law School

Richard Frankel*
Associate Professor
Drexel University Kline School of Law

Linda Bosniak*
Distinguished Professor
Rutgers Law School

Kristina M. Campbell*
Jack and Lovell Olender Professor of Law UDC
David A. Clarke School of Law

Victor C. Romero*
Professor of Law
Penn State Law (University Park)

Jennifer Lee Koh*
Professor of Law
Western State College of Law

Thomas McDonnell*
Professor of Law
Elisabeth Haub School of Law at Pace University

Katherine Tinto*
Assistant Clinical Professor of Law
UC Irvine School of Law

Kathleen M Burch*
Professor
Atlanta's John Marshall Law School

Margaret Montoya*
Professor Emerita of Law
University of New Mexico School of Law

Taylor Flynn*
Professor
Western New England School of Law

Jennifer B. Condon*
Professor of Law
Seton Hall Law School

Maryellen Fullerton*
Professor of Law
Brooklyn Law School

Jean C. Han*
Practitioner-In-Residence
AU Washington College of Law

Prerna Lal*
Staff Attorney and Clinical Supervisor EBCLC
Berkeley Law School

Amelia McGowan*
Adjunct Professor
Mississippi College School of Law

Millard A. Murphy*
Lecturer At Law
UC Davis School of Law

Geoffrey Hoffman*
Director of the Immigration Clinic
University of Houston Law Ctr.

Alina Das*
Professor of Clinical Law
New York University School of Law

Sri Ragavan*
Texas A&M University School of Law
Institutional affiliations are for identification purposes only.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Position</th>
<th>Institution</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Kathy Moccio*</td>
<td>Visiting Assistant Clinical Professor</td>
<td>Binger Center for New Americans</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>University of Minnesota Law School</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kaci Bishop*</td>
<td>Clinical Associate Professor of Law</td>
<td>University of North Carolina School of Law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Estelle McKee*</td>
<td>Clinical Professor</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Cornell Law School</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deserée Kennedy*</td>
<td>Professor of Law</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Touro Law Center</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Saba N. Ahmed*</td>
<td>Clinical Instructor</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Immigration &amp; Human Rights Clinic</td>
<td>University of the District of Columbia, David A.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Clarke School of Law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Virgil Wiebe*</td>
<td>Professor of Law</td>
<td>Robins Kaplan Director of Clinical Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>University of St. Thomas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lee J. Terán*</td>
<td>Clinical Professor of Law (retired)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>St. Mary's University School of Law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marisa S. Cianciarulo*</td>
<td>Professor of Law</td>
<td>Associate Dean for Academic Affairs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Michael Kagan*</td>
<td>Professor of Law</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>University of Nevada, Las Vegas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peter L. Markowitz*</td>
<td>Professor of Law</td>
<td>Cardozo School of Law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carrie Rosenbaum*</td>
<td>Adjunct Professor</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Golden Gate University School of Law</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maria Woltjen*</td>
<td>Executive Director</td>
<td>University of Chicago Law School</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maria M. Pabon*</td>
<td>Professor of Law</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Loyola University New Orleans</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Irene Scharf*</td>
<td>Professor</td>
<td>UMass Law School</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cindy Zapata*</td>
<td>Clinical Instructor</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Harvard Immigration and Refugee Clinical Program</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Charisa Smith*</td>
<td>Visiting Assistant Professor</td>
<td>CUNY Law School</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jason A. Cade*</td>
<td>Associate Professor</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>University of Georgia Law School</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sherially Munshi*</td>
<td>Associate Professor of Law</td>
<td>Georgetown University Law Center</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>J. Anna Cabot*</td>
<td>Clinical Teaching Fellow</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>University of Connecticut School of Law</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stacy Caplow*</td>
<td>Professor of Law</td>
<td>Brooklyn Law School</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Institutional affiliations are for identification purposes only.
Sameer M. Ashar*
Clinical Professor of Law
University of California, Irvine

Nermeen Saba Arastu*
Clinical Law Professor
CUNY School of Law

Claire R. Thomas*
Director, Asylum Clinic
Adjunct Professor of Law
New York Law School

Aaron Tarin*
Adjunct Associate Professor
University of Utah

Miriam Marton*
Assistant Clinical Professor
University of Tulsa College of Law

Julia Vazquez*
Community Lawyering Clinic Director
Southwestern Law School

K. Babe Howell*
Professor
CUNY School of Law

Caitlin Patler*
Assistant Professor of Sociology
UC Davis

Virgil Wiebe*
Professor of Law
Robins Kaplan Director of Clinical Education
University of St. Thomas

James Frank Smith*
Professor Emeritus
UC Davis School of Law

Shoba Sivaprasad Wadhia*
Clinical Professor of Law
Penn State Law- University Park

Raquel Aldana*
Professor of Law
UC Davis School of Law

Elora Mukherjee*
Associate Clinical Professor of Law
Columbia Law School